BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 10084255 8

CANADIAN CHILDREN'S LAW: A COURSEBOOK

PART II

by

DON STUART

and

NICHOLAS BALA

Prepared for use of students at

FACULTY OF LAW
QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY
KINGSTON, ONTARIO

July, 1986

LAW LIBRARY

JAN 29 1987

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CANADIAN CHILDREN'S LAW: A COURSEBOOK

VOLUME TWO

BY

DON STUART

AND

NICHOLAS BALA

JULY, 1986

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/canadianchildren02stua

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER 6: INTRODUCTION: "CHILD-SAVING" AND "CHILDREN'S RIGHTS"	1
A. Historical Perspective	2
Leon, "The Development of Canadian Juvenile Justice: A Background for Reform"	4
B. Models of Procedure	6
Catton, "Models of Procedure and the Juvenile Courts"	7
C. The Canadian Response	10
Bala, The Young Offenders Act: Why a New Era in Juvenile Justice	12
D. Developments In Other Jurisdictions	26
Fox, "New Moves in Canada's Search for Juvenile Justice	26
Criminal Justice Act, 1982	27
Re Gault	30
CHAPTER 7: CAUSES OF DELINQUENT BEHAVIOUR	33
A. Introduction	33
B. The Biological Perspective	33
1. Introduction	33
2. Gross Chromosomal Abnormality	34
3. Heritability	34
Senate Committee, Child at Risk	34
4. Minimal Brain Dysfunction, Learning Disabilities and Hyperactivity	36
Senate Committee, Child at Risk	36

5. Need for Stimulation of Sensory Input in Antisocial Personality 37

Hare, Psychopathy: Theory and Research 37

C. The Psychological Perspective 39

1. Delinquency as Neurotic System 39

Weiner, "Delinquency as a Neurotic Symptom" 39

2. Delinquency as a Characterological Orientation: Antisocial Personality 40

Weiner, "Delinquency as a Neurotic Symptom" 40

3. Socialized Delinquency 43

Trasler, "Individual Differences of Constitutional Origin" 43

4. Child Abuse 44

Senate Committee, Child at Risk 44

D. The Sociological Perspective 45

1. Differential Association 45

Silverman and Teevan, Crime in Canadian Society 46

2. Anomie Theory 47

Silverman and Teevan, "Theories of Crime and Delinquency" 47

3. Subcultural Theories 48

Silverman and Teevan, "Theories of Crime and Delinquency" 48

4. Labelling Theory 51

Silverman and Teevan, "Glossary of Offences and Terms" 51

Mahoney, "The Effect of Labelling Upon Youths in the Juvenile Justice System: A Review of the Evidence" 52

Moyer, Diversion from the Juvenile Justice System and its Impact on Children: A Review of the Literature 52

West, Young Offenders and the State 54

E. Prevention of Delinquency 56

CHAPTER 8: LEGAL RESPONSES TO DEVIANT BEHAVIOUR 57

A. Age 57

1. Upper Age Limit 58

(a) Provincial Concerns 59

Table, Age of Juveniles in the National Study 60

(b) Provincial Responses 61

"Ontario Youth Courts to Separate Cases According to Age" 62

"Sentences Are Longer Under New Youth Law" 63

"Ottawa Judge Fears Provincial Decision" 64

"Provincial Judges to Continue Trying Young Offenders" 64

Hogg, Constitutional Law of Canada 66

Wilson, "Children and Equality Rights" 67

R. v. A.M. 69

R. v. Oakes 71

Andrews v. L.S.B.C. 74

2. Jurisdiction Based on Age 83

R. v. L. 84

3. Proof of Age 86

(a) Actual Age 86

R. v. Lachapelle 87

(b) Apparent Age 90

R. v. Pilkington 90

4. Minimum Age for Criminal Responsibility 92

"Law Courts Spawn Fagins, Officials Fear" 94

Family Court Clinic Brief 96

B. Conduct Attracting a Legal Response 98

1. Offence Jurisdiction 98

2. Morality and Disposition Jurisdiction 99

Wadlington, Children in the Legal System 100

Barnhorst, "Female Delinquency and the Role of Women" 103

Barnhorst, Female Delinquents and the Juvenile Justice System 108

(a) Morality Jurisdiction 109

Juvenile Delinquency in Canada 110

(b) Disposition Jurisdiction 111

C. Extra-Judicial Responses 114

1. Formally Recognized Procedures 114

(a) Alternate Measures 114

(i) Introduction 114

(ii) Section 4 116

Regina v. Drew 128

(iii) Effect of Alternative Measures on Young Offenders 131

Moyer, Diversion from the Juvenile Justice System and its Impact on Children: A Review of the Literature 131

Morton and West, An Experiment in Diversion by a Citizen Committee 134

2. Informal Procedures 143

(a) Police Screening 143

CHAPTER 9: THE JUVENILE COURT HEARING 148

A. Pre-Hearing Issues 148

1. Applicable Procedure 149

Bala, "Jury Trials for Children?" 150

R. v. R.L. 150

Brief of the Manitoba Society on Criminology 152

2. The Exclusive Jurisdiction of the Youth Court 153

(a) Transfer of Jurisdiction 155

3. The Laying of the Information 156

Canadian Council of Juvenile and Family Court Judges 156

(a) Form of the Charge 156

4. Limitation Periods 157

5. Notice of Hearings 158

Regina v. L. 161

R. v. F.G. 163

6. Arrest and Detention 164

(a) Rights Arising Upon Arrest or Detention 164

R. v. Shannon H 166

R. v. C.V. 168

(i) Temporary Restraint 171

(ii) Judicial Interim Release 171

(iii) Detention for Medical Reports 172

R. v. D.S. 173

R. v. J.M. 174

(b) Pre-trial Detention 176

(i) Availability of Detention Facilities 177

Juvenile Delinquency in Canada 177

A.G. v. Choquette 179

(ii) Detention Separate from Adults 180

R. v. P. 181

(iii) Placement in Care of Responsible Person 183

R. v. Brandie T. 184

The Queen v. L.G. 185

B. Adjudication 186

1. Rights of the Young Person 186

(a) Right to Counsel 186

"New law for young to strain legal aid" 189

"Use of Criminal Lawyers Assailed" 190

Ontario Ministry of Attorney General 192

(b) Rights of the Accused 195

2. Special Considerations 196

(a) Privacy of Youth Court Trials 196

Southam Inc. v. The Queen 199

Campbell, "Feathers in the Aquarium and Fish Scales" 207

(b) Pleas 208

Adgey v. R. 210

"Judge Concerned Guilty Pleas Unfair" 212

(c) Insanity and Unfitness 213

(i) Unfitness to Stand Trial 213

(ii) Insanity 216

Jordan, "The Survival of the Insanity Defence" 219

"15-Year-Old Murderer Gets Three Years" 224

(d) Evidentiary Matters 225

(i) Testimony of Children and Young Persons 225

Ontario Law Reform Commission 228

R. v. Fletcher 229

(ii) Corroboration 235

Vetrovec v. R. 237

(e) Admissions 242

(i) Exclusion of Evidence under the Charter 242

(ii) Admissibility of Statements of Young Persons 243

Regina v. R. (No. 1) 244

Re A. 247

"Assault by cops led to confession: Youth" 248

R. v. C. 250

R. v. B.M. 252

R. v. S.L. 252

R. v. A.B. 256

Bailey, "Born to Lose" 264

Rich, Interviewing Children and Adolescents 268

(f) Records 269

"Ruling in Acquittal Points to Flaw in New Law" 270

(i) Youth Court Records 271

(ii) Police Records 275

(iii) Government and Private Records 276

(iv) Fingerprints and Photographs 277

(v) Destruction of Records 279

(g) Appeals 284

CHAPTER 10: TRANSFER PROCEEDINGS 287

A. Initiation of Proceedings 289

B. Procedure 290

Re David and The Queen 290

Regina v. F.J.Y. 291

C. Factors Relevant to Transfer 292

R. v. C.J.M. 293

D. Effect of Transfer 301

E. Review 302

F. Restrictions on Publication 303

CHAPTER 11: DISPOSITION OF THE YOUNG OFFENDER 304

A. Procedure and Evidence 304

R. v. Gardiner 304

R. v. R.I. 306

B. Dispositional Alternatives 306

1. Discharges 312

2. Fines 313

3. Compensation, Restitution and Community Service Orders 314

Preliminary Report on the State of Community Service Orders in the Provincial Court (Family Division) 318

4. Prohibition 321

5. Detention for Treatment 322

Kittrie, The Right to be Different 323

Family Court Clinic Brief 325

6. Probation 326

Juvenile Delinquency in Canada 327

Juvenile Probationer in Ontario 327

7. Custody 335

R. v. Gordon J. 337

R. v. B.D. 338

"Teen Tells of Discipline" 340

Winterdyk and Roesch, "A Wilderness Experimental Program As An Alternative For Probationers: An Evaluation" 341

R. v. R.I. 345

R. v. G.K. 349

Little, "The Need for Reform in the Juvenile Courts" 351

Laplante, "Training Schools: What Do They Accomplish?" 351

MacDonald, "Juvenile Training Schools and Juvenile Justice Policy in British Columbia 355

The Family, The Courts and The Community 356

8. Other Reasonable Conditions 359

9. Disposition Not Included 363

R. v. T.L. 363

C. Judicial Review of Disposition 366

D. Determining Disposition 374

1. Assessment and Diagnosis: The Role of Professionals 374

(a) Section 13--Medical or Psychological Examination 374

Awad and Chamberlain, "The Process of Psychiatric Work with the Juvenile Courts" 382

(b) Pre-disposition Reports 386

The Diagnostic Clinic in a Juvenile and Family Court Setting 392

R. v. Shane B. 394

2. Judicial Discretion 397

Hogarth, Sentencing as Human Process 399

MacAskill and Andrews, "The Role of the Youth Court Judge at the Dispositional Hearing" 401

(a) Treatment and its Effectiveness 403

Martinson, "What Works?--Questions and Answers About Prison Reform, The Public Interest" 404

Shamsie, "Antisocial Adolescents: Our Treatments Do Not Work--Where Do We Go From Here?" 406

CHAPTER 12: ROLE OF THE LAWYER, PROSECUTOR AND JUDGE 412

A. The Role of the Defence Lawyer 412

R. v. Gerald X 413

Wizner, "Juvenile Justice and the Rehabilitative Ideal: A Response to Mr. Stapleton" 416

Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-committee Report On The Legal Representation of Children 417

Catton and Erickson, "The Juvenile's Perception of the Role of Defence Counsel in Juvenile Court" 418

Alexander, "Constitutional Rights in Juvenile Court" 423

Isaacs, "The Lawyer in the Juvenile Court" 425

1. Capacity to Retain and Instruct Counsel 426

Leon, "Recent Developments in the Legal Representation of Children: A Growing Concern with the Concept of Capacity 426

R. v. Wayne W.W. 431

Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-Committee Report On The Legal Representation of Children 432

B. The Role of the Prosecutor 432

Erickson, "The Defence Lawyer's Role in Juvenile Court" 433

Grosman, "Young Offenders Before the Courts" 434

Fish, "Bill C-192: Another View" 435

Boucher v. The Queen 436

C. The Role of the Judge 436

Bala, Comment on Smith v. Zeiger: The Role of the Judge in Family Court" 437

Royal Commission Inquiry into Civil Rights 439

MacAskill and Andrews, "The Role of the Youth Court Judge at the Dispositional Hearing" 440